DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 445 275 CE 080 791

AUTHOR Millar, Pat; Falk, Ian
TITLE Communication and Catering Competencies: A Case Study of Literacy and Numeracy Inclusion in a Training Package. Implementation of the Hospitality Training Package and the Effects of the Inclusion of Literacy and Numeracy in Industry Standards in the Training Package, in Relation to Regional and Rural Centres.
INSTITUTION Adult Literacy and Numeracy Australian Research Consortium, Melbourne (Victoria). Victorian Centre.
SPONS AGENCY Australian Dept. of Employment, Education, Training and Youth Affairs, Canberra.; Australian National Training Authority, Brisbane.
ISBN ISBN-1-876768-07-X
PUB DATE 2000-00-00
NOTE 45p.; Produced by the Tasmanian Centre of the Adult Literacy and Numeracy Australian Research Consortium. For related reports by the same preparing institution, see CE 080 790-797.
AVAILABLE FROM Language Australia or ARIS, GPO Box 372F, Melbourne VIC 3001, Australia, Tel: 61 3 9926 4779, Fax: 61 3 9926 4780, E-mail: sales@la.ames.vic.edu.au, Web site: http://sunsite.anu.edu.au/language-australia ($13.20 Australian).
PUB TYPE Reports - Evaluative (142)
EDRS PRICE MF01/PC02 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS Academic Standards; Adult Basic Education; Adult Learning; Adult Literacy; Case Studies; *Communication Skills; Competence; Competency Based Education; Curriculum Development; Delivery Systems; Discourse Analysis; Education Work Relationship; Foreign Countries; Fused Curriculum; *Hospitality Occupations; Instructional Effectiveness; Instructional Materials; *Integrated Curriculum; Labor Force Development; Learning Modules; *Literacy Education; Literature Reviews; Material Development; National Curriculum; *Numeracy; Outcomes of Education; Regional Planning; Rural Areas; Rural Education; Training Methods; *Vocational Education
IDENTIFIERS Australia (Tasmania); Catering; Impact Studies; *National Training Packages (Australia)

ABSTRACT

The implementation of the Australian national training package for hospitality occupations in Tasmania and the effects of inclusion of literacy and numeracy competencies in the training package were examined in a case study. Data were gathered through a literature review, analysis of the hospitality training package, workplace data, and discussions and interviews with seven trainers, three representatives of the adult literacy sector and one executive officer from each of the following agencies: Tasmanian Community, Property and Health Services Industry Training Board, Inc.; Tasmanian Tourism and Hospitality Industry Training Board; and Office of Vocational Education and Training. Major findings included the following: (1) trainers have had insufficient time to address the major shift from

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made from the original document.

curriculum-based to training package-based training; (2) no major changes have occurred in training delivery to regional and rural trainees or in assessment modes; (3) strategies for dealing with language, literacy, and numeracy have not been an initial priority with trainers; and (4) the training package's dominant discourse derives from the context of vocational education and training. (The bibliography lists 34 references. An examination of literacy and numeracy competencies in the training package's units and a discourse analysis of the five core units are appended.) (MN)

Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made
from the original document.

ED 445 275

Adult Literacy and Numeracy Australian Research Consortium

ALNARC

Communication and catering competencies:

a case study of literacy and numeracy inclusion in a training package

Pat Millar & Ian Falk

PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE AND DISSEMINATE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

C. Dunk

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

1

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

☑ This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy

Implementation of the Hospitality Training Package and the effects of the inclusion of literacy and numeracy in industry standards in the training package, in relation to regional and rural centres.

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

Communication and catering competencies:

a case study of literacy and numeracy inclusion in a training package

Pat Millar & Ian Falk

Implementation of the Hospitality Training Package and the effects of the inclusion of literacy and numeracy in industry standards in the training package, in relation to regional and rural centres.

Communication and catering competencies: a case study of literacy and numeracy inclusion in a training package.

Pat Millar and Ian Falk

ISBN 1 876768 07 X

Produced by the Tasmanian Centre of the
Adult Literacy and Numeracy Australian Research Consortium
(ALNARC)

Published for ALNARC by Language Australia,
the National Languages and Literacy Institute of Australia Ltd
GPO Box 372F
Melbourne VIC 3001

All enquires in relation to this publication should be addressed to
The Adult Literacy and Numeracy Australian Research Consortium (ALNARC)
School of Education
Victoria University
Footscray Park Campus
MCMC 14428
Melbourne VIC 8001

Email: alnarc@vu.edu.au

© 2000 Commonwealth of Australia.
No parts may be reproduced by any process except with the written permission of the Commonwealth of Australia or in accordance with the provisions of the Copyright Act.

The views expressed in this publication are those of the authors and do not necessarily reflect the views or policies of the Commonwealth of Australia.

Contents

Chapter One		1
1.1	The project	1
1.2	Background	1
1.3	Definition of terms	2
1.4	Goals	3
1.5	Summary	3
Chapter Two		4
2.1	Literature review	4
2.2	Summary	5
Chapter Three		6
3.1	Methodology	6
3.2	The site	6
3.3	Data collection	8
3.3.1	Training package data	8
3.3.2	Registered Training Organisation data	10
3.3.3	Workplace data	11
3.4	Summary	11
Chapter Four		12
4.1	Implementation of training package	12
4.2	Examination of literacy and numeracy competencies in units of the training package	13
4.3	Discursive factors affecting clarity, readability, and with the potential to affect delivery	16
4.4	Literacies of the workplace and of the training	17

4.5	Assessment	19
4.6	Attitudes to training	21
4.7	Summary	23
Chapter Five		24
5.1	Conclusions	24
5.2	Summary	25
References		27
Appendix A	Examination of literacy and numeracy competencies in units of the training package	29
Appendix B	Discourse analysis of five core units	34

Chapter One

1.1 The Project

This project forms part of the national research undertaken in 1999 by the Adult Literacy and Numeracy Australian Research Consortium, ALNARC, into effects of the incorporation of English language, literacy and numeracy competencies into the competency standards of training packages. The research was funded by the Australian National Training Authority (ANTA), through the Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs (DETYA). The Tasmanian project was conducted by the Tasmanian ALNARC centre, at the Centre for Research and Learning in Regional Australia, University of Tasmania, Launceston.

1.2 Background

Tasmania has the most decentralised population of all states in Australia, with the lowest percentage, of all states, of its population living in its capital city. In 1993, Tasmania had 41% of its population living in Hobart, while the national average was 63.4% (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 1995). Approximately 30% of its population live in regional cities and towns, with the remaining 30% living in rural localities (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 1999). This wide dispersal of people across large and small towns in a regional/rural classification increases the cost and complexity of delivering services (Tasmanian Government, 1999). Tasmania's population is ageing, with a median age of 34 years in 1996 compared to 32 years in 1991 (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 1996). Tasmania is expected to become the state with the oldest average age early in the twenty-first century (Australian Bureau of Statistics, 1999).

Regional and rural communities are special needs groups when it comes to training. The small size and the diverse nature of many of them results in difficulties in obtaining minimum class sizes required by service providers, and limited choice of training available, particularly to rural employers, communities, and individuals (Kilpatrick et al., 1999). Similarly, the small size of many regional and rural businesses results in

lower numbers of participants available for needed training courses. In rural areas, the perception of many self-employed people that training requires a needs-based, problem-solving approach, and that direct applicability of training is more important than accreditation, may put the requirements of local industries and communities at odds with the vocational education and training national policy framework which is built around the needs of specific industries (Kilpatrick et al., 1999).

For this project, it was decided to report on two training packages which are being used widely in Tasmania, these being Hospitality and Community Services. Because these industries are growth areas in Tasmania (Tasmanian Government, 1999), training in them is occurring in many workplaces simultaneously. However, some units of the Community Services Training Package are still being transitionally delivered on the superseded curriculum-based model. For analysis of implementation and the effects of inclusion of literacy and numeracy in industry standards, therefore, this research focuses on the Hospitality Training Package.

1.3 Definition of terms

In this study, 'implementation' of the training package is defined as what goes on in the context of training, as well as the contextual issues surrounding the training, including what training providers, managers, and trainees think about the training package. Language, literacy and numeracy skills underlie most areas of work and influence the performance of workplace tasks (Mikulecky, 1988; Askov and Aderman, 1991; Department of Employment, Education and Training 1993; O'Connor, 1993; Newcombe, 1994; Hull et al., 1996). Incorporating explicit reference to these skills in the competency standards format of training packages is an important step towards ensuring that the packages accurately reflect this vital aspect of workplace tasks (Hawke et al., 1997; ANTA, 1998). Clarity, readability and accuracy of representations of literacy and numeracy practices required to do the job are highly important if their inclusion in industry standards in the packages is to achieve the aim of helping trainers and trainees do their jobs more efficiently.

'Effects of the inclusion of literacy and numeracy in industry standards' focuses on stakeholders' understanding of literacy and numeracy and their perception of outcomes of inclusion of

communication competencies in the training package. We also investigate relevant communications aspects of these understandings and perceptions.

Literacies of the workplace and of the training operate contextually and interactively (Hull et al., 1996; Gee, 1999). This study also investigates these literacies as they are manifested in context, in interaction with use of training packages, and in the views of trainees, trainers, and management.

1.4 Goals

The project aims to:

1. examine the implementation of training packages as exampled in one industry area and one training package, Hospitality, in particular the Certificate III in Hospitality (Catering Operations);
2. examine for accuracy and comprehensiveness of description the literacy and numeracy competencies detailed in relevant units of the Hospitality Training Package, using document analysis techniques to assess discursive factors affecting clarity, readability, and with the potential to affect delivery;
3. examine the literacies of the workplace and of the training, as manifested in context and in the views of trainees using the Hospitality and Community Services Training Packages, of their training providers and trainers, and of management.

1.5 Summary

Implementation of training packages in Tasmania is occurring in an ageing, regional/rural context, often involving special needs groups. This study reports on aspects of a training package which is being used widely in Tasmania, this being Hospitality. Incorporating explicit reference to literacy and numeracy skills in the competency standards format of training packages is an important step towards ensuring that the packages accurately reflect this vital aspect of workplace tasks. This study examines the implementation of the training package and examines the inclusion in it of literacy and numeracy competencies. It also examines the literacies of the workplace and of the training, and in this context considers aspects of delivery of certain units of the Community Services Training Package, still in a transitional stage from the curriculum-based system, because hospitality and community services training occurs simultaneously at many sites in regional/rural areas.

Chapter Two

2.1 Literature review

The literature to date on training packages and the inclusion of literacy and numeracy in industry standards in training packages is limited.

A two-part report by Gibb et al. (1996) examined a pilot study into the warehousing and distribution industry, and offered an attendant model for incorporating English language and literacy competencies into industry/enterprise standards. The authors believed that such incorporation would make language and literacy training more likely to be delivered, and that this training would more likely be tailored specifically for the workplace.

The Hospitality Training Package was one of four developing packages examined by Hawke et al. (1997), who identified a need for improved access to information on training packages for non-metropolitan stakeholders and small to medium-sized enterprises and providers.

Much of the published work on training packages originates from the Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs (DETYA, formerly DEETYA) and the Australian National Training Authority (ANTA). *Workplace Communication in National Training Packages: A Practical Guide* (DEETYA, 1997) proposed a four step process for incorporation of language, literacy and numeracy into industry standards, which was piloted with a number of training package developers and national industry bodies. A detailed revision of the four steps was published by ANTA in 1998.

The wide range of skills and services involved in the competency standards in Australia's tourism and hospitality industries were outlined by Galvin (1998), but the incorporation of language, literacy and numeracy skills was mentioned only cursorily.

The training implications of the ageing of the Australian population need to be further researched. Qualifications appear to become less important to people as they get older, and this may mean that the training and learning experiences on offer may not fit the tactical approaches of older people towards their training and learning needs (Smith, 1999).

2.2 Summary

The literature on inclusion of literacy and numeracy in industry standards in training packages is still in early stages.

Chapter Three

3.1 Methodology

Within the qualitative inquiry strategy of this study, the principles of the theme of naturalistic inquiry (Lincoln and Guba, 1985) form the basis of its methodology. This is a discovery-oriented approach, non-manipulative, unobtrusive, and non-controlling, with no predetermined constraints on outcomes (Patton, 1990).

Discussions and interviews were conducted with:

- an executive officer of the Tasmanian Community, Property and Health Services Industry Training Board Inc.,
- an executive officer of the Tasmanian Tourism and Hospitality Industry Training Board,
- three representatives of the Adult Literacy sector,
- and an executive officer from the Office of Vocational Education and Training, Hobart.

A research site was selected in rural Tasmania in a town which will be referred to here as Laketown.

3.2 The site

Laketown has a population of around 600, but as an administrative, commercial and services centre it is a focus for surrounding smaller towns, hamlets and farms, which effectively quadruples its population for these purposes. Features of the site include an ageing population (the locality's median age is 35), with women outnumbering men. There are significant numbers of people with redundant skills due to the disappearance of traditional rural jobs. Some have limited literacy because of interrupted or curtailed formal schooling. Laketown has a low per capita income, with a high proportion of welfare recipients. There is limited local employment availability and high unemployment. Membership of more than one equity group increases disadvantage significantly, and the community in and around Laketown has the typical

economic problems which face regional and rural Australia generally.

The Laketown community has various streams of educational and training opportunity. Adult Education courses, workshops, facilitation services and lifelong learning programs are on offer at the Community College, after-hours at the school, and elsewhere. Work for the Dole trainees in the local Community Online Access Centre do basic levels of an Information Technology (computer services) qualification in conjunction with Hobart College. In various workplaces, training is being done. One of the town's biggest employers is the Multi-Purpose Health Centre run by the local government authority. The Centre includes a hospital section, a hostel for the infirm, and a nursing home, as well as facilities for the two local doctors. The kitchen complex also caters for the local Meals on Wheels organisation. The Centre has about forty staff in all. Two-thirds of all employees at the Centre are over thirty years old, with one-third over forty. Most are women. Staff change-over occurs seldom, and most have worked there for at least several years.

Training is currently important at the Laketown Multi-Purpose Health Centre, helped by a federal government financial incentive. As well as the retraining of enrolled nurses, there is training occurring throughout, with all hospital aides doing Personal Care (certificate III) through TAFE, all domestic staff doing Patient Services (certificate III) through an RTO called here Derwent Training, and all kitchen staff doing Hospitality - Catering Operations - (certificate III) through an RTO called here TasTrain.

Our investigation of training at the site was limited to the literacy and numeracy related experiences of trainees doing Hospitality (Catering Operations) and those doing Community Services (Patient Services). These trainees were staff who interacted constantly with each other and sometimes their duties overlapped. Broadly speaking, their social and their work-related literacy and numeracy practices were similar. The two training groups provided scope to examine the literacies of the workplace and of the training, as manifested in context and in their views, as well as the views of trainers and management.

Patient Services, at this time, was still a curriculum-based course within the 1999 endorsed Community Services Training Package. Because of this, we did not examine its components, but concentrated on the Hospitality Training Package core and elective units for Catering Operations, Certificate III, in which literacy and numeracy are included in industry standards. The Patient Services trainers' and trainees' experience

and comments provided useful data for our examination of literacies of the workplace and of training.

3.3 Data collection

A range of data was collected and examined. These data came from a number of sources including:

1. Training package data: analysis of units of the Hospitality Training Package;

2. Industry Training Advisory Body and Registered Training Organisation data:
   - interviews and discussions with two ITAB officers (from Tourism and Hospitality, and Community, Property, and Health Services);
   - interviews with TasTrain trainers (the Hospitality Team Leader, the Manager of Cookery, and a Cookery teacher), transcripts, and field notes;
   - interviews with Derwent Training trainers (the Training Coordinator, South, and the Coordinator, Access and Equity Unit);

3. Workplace data:
   - transcripts and notes of interviews with Nurse Manager and Executive Officer of Laketown Multi-Purpose Health Centre;
   - transcripts and notes of interviews with six catering and five domestic staff at the Multi-Purpose Health Centre, observation notes of catering and domestic staff performing tasks involved in the training.

3.3.1 Training package data

This study collected training package data from two sources: the training package documents themselves, and interviews with stakeholders about the training package. This section of the methodology deals with the training package as documents.

Units of the training package were examined for comprehensiveness and accuracy of literacy and numeracy competencies. These are units which form the qualification Certificate III (Catering Operations):

Core Units:

THHCOR01A	*Work with Colleagues and Customers*
THHCOR02A	*Work in a Socially Diverse Environment*
THHCOR03A	*Follow Health, Safety and Security Procedures*
THHHCO01A	*Develop and Update Hospitality Industry Knowledge*
THHGHS01A	*Follow Workplace Hygiene Procedures*
THHBCC11A	*Implement Food Safety Procedures*
THHBCAT02A	*Package Prepared Foodstuffs*
THHBCAT03A	*Transport and Store Food in a Safe and Hygienic Manner*
THHBCAT06A	*Apply Catering Control Procedures*
THHBCC13A	*Plan and Control Menu Based Catering*
THHADCAT01A	*Prepare Daily Meal Plans to Promote Good Health*
THHGGA01A	*Communicate on the Telephone*
THHGCS02A	*Promote Products and Services to Customers*
THHGCS03A	*Deal with Conflict Situations*
THHGTR01A	*Coach Others in Job Skills*

Elective Units:

THHBCC02A	*Prepare Appetisers and Salads*
THHBCC02aA	*Prepare Sandwiches*
THHBCC03A	*Prepare Stocks and Sauces*
THHBCC03aA	*Prepare Soups*
THHBCC04A	*Prepare Vegetables, Eggs and Farinaceous Dishes*
THHBCC08A	*Prepare Hot and Cold Desserts*

Discursive factors in the training package affect clarity and readability, and have the potential to affect delivery. Units of the package are documents representing certain constructions of reality (Foucault, 1969; Habermas, 1971). This study focuses on specific communications aspects of the documents: how the documents define topics and represent them to readers by means of the discourses that characterise and weave through the units (Gee, 1999). Textual effects merge with the interactive process of reading (Lincoln and Guba, 1985), including the reader's repertoire of discourses (Gee, 1992) to construct the unit's comprehensibility.

Because units of training packages are constructed through language, linguistic analysis is an appropriate method of assessing them for comprehensibility. Discourse analysis, a technique from within qualitative methods for deconstructing text so as to uncover its operant values (Falk, 1994), is a fitting tool for examination of the language of the

units. Its objective is to develop ways of revealing what texts are saying at various levels, using a disciplined process of reading them on multiple levels. The method of discourse analysis drawn on in this study is that of Gee (1990, 1992, 1999). Units from the Hospitality Training Package subjected to discourse analysis were:

From Core Units, CERTIFICATE III in HOSPITALITY (CATERING OPERATIONS):

THHCOR01A	*Work with Colleagues and Customers*
THHCOR02A	*Work in a Socially Diverse Environment*
THHCOR03A	*Follow Health, Safety and Security Procedures*
THHHCO01A	*Develop and Update Hospitality Industry Knowledge*
THHGHS01A	*Follow Workplace Hygiene Procedures*

These five core units were the competencies assessed first in the training of the catering staff at the Laketown Multi-Purpose Health Centre.

3.3.2 Registered Training Organisation data

Interviews complying with the university's ethical requirements were conducted over a period of six months. Where possible they were taped and transcribed. Telephone discussions were recorded by note-taking, as were certain other discussions where taping was not possible.

Interviews were conducted with the Hospitality Team Leader, the Manager of Cookery, and a Cookery teacher from TasTrain, Hobart, the training provider for Hospitality Certificate III (Catering Operations).

Interviewees were asked to comment on the following issues:

What language, literacy and numeracy requirements are explicit within the competency standards you are using?

In what ways are they made explicit in the training package?

Are communication skills included at the Element level, or at the Performance Criteria level, or as Underpinning Skills and Knowledge?

How do you ensure that your training materials and learning activities explicitly address the identified language, literacy and numeracy aspects?

Do you have trainees who have literacy and numeracy difficulties?

Are literacy teachers being used in cooperation and collaboration with VET teachers?

How does the new system compare with the old, from the point of view of the impact on students?

Since catering (kitchen) and domestic (cleaning) staff at the Laketown Multi-Purpose Health Centre work together, interviews also took place with personnel from Derwent Training, the training provider for Community Services Certificate III (Patient Services) being done by the domestic staff. Interviewees were the Training Coordinator (South) and the Coordinator, Access and Equity Unit. Questions and discussions focused on the problem of literacy and numeracy difficulties, which were early identified in the group of trainees.

Both RTOs gave their approval for the research and were generous with their time and assistance.

3.3.3 Workplace Data

Interviews were conducted with the Nurse Manager and the Executive Officer of the Laketown Multi-Purpose Health Centre, and approval for the research was given. Interviews - individual and group - with six catering and five domestic staff were conducted on five occasions, before, during, and after blocks of training.

3.4 Summary

After discussions and interviews with stakeholders, a research site was selected in rural Tasmania in a town referred to here as Laketown, where staff at the Multi-Purpose Health Centre were involved in training, including all domestic staff doing Patient Services (Certificate III), and all kitchen staff doing Hospitality - Catering Operations - (Certificate III). These trainees were staff who interacted constantly with each other and sometimes their duties overlapped.

Data came from a number of sources including training package data (where we conducted analyses of units of the Hospitality Training Package), Industry Training Advisory Body and Registered Training Organisation data, and workplace data.

Chapter Four

4.1 Implementation of training package

Implementation of the Hospitality Training Package has passed the first phase. The package will soon undergo its first formal review. TasTrain's Hospitality Team Leader claimed that "Tasmania is the most advanced of the states with the Hospitality Training Package. We're 12 months ahead." Nevertheless, it is still early to arrive at any firm conclusions about outcomes.

Trainers and teachers have had little additional time to prepare their work for what they see as a major shift from curriculum-based training to training packages. They have been faced with adaptations needing to be made quickly. The achievement of these adaptations is uneven and has resulted in some anomalies.

TasTrain's Manager of Cookery said:

> *We've been really fortunate in the cooking area that a lot of our modules were already developed, so we've found the implementation of it extremely easy, now we're just running with it. We don't have any problems in the cookery area with the training package.*

However, she admitted:

> *The drop out rate has been quite high, through mature age students not having the literacy skills. About fifteen drop out, all mature age students, out of 165 students in a year.*

Strategies for dealing with language, literacy and numeracy do not appear to have been an initial priority, despite the inclusion of these in industry standards in the training package. No major change has occurred in the way that Certificate III (Catering Operations) is presently being delivered. Data from the Laketown Multi-Purpose Health Centre Hospitality training revealed no clear activity around literacy and numeracy.

4.2 Examination of literacy and numeracy competencies in units of the training package

The relevant units of the Hospitality Training Package show an uneven presence of literacy and numeracy competencies.

Comment on all of the units analysed is included in Appendix A. As an example here, analysis of one of the units already completed by the catering trainees at the Laketown Multi-Purpose Health Centre, unit *THHHCO01A, Develop and Update Hospitality Industry Knowledge*, is detailed.

This "is a core unit that underpins effective performance in all other units" (Hospitality Training Package, Hospitality Core, p. 4), and could therefore be said to be of critical importance to the training package's effectiveness in incorporating literacy and numeracy competencies, and also to the training process and the interaction of trainees with the process, and to attitudinal aspects they might develop towards the training and to their trade.

Literacy and numeracy aspects are implicitly involved in both Elements ("Seek information ..." and "Update knowledge"), and in the associated Performance Criteria, but they are not explicitly described. Page 1 therefore lists Elements and Performance Criteria which are based on an assumption that the trainee already has the literacy and numeracy skills at the levels required to perform the tasks described.

The Range of Variables on page 2 includes information sources which can only be effectively accessed by people with appropriate levels of literacy and numeracy skills: "reference books, libraries ... industry journals, internet ..."

In the Evidence Guide on page 3, Underpinning Skills and Knowledge include:

Basic research skills:

- Identification of relevant information
- Questioning techniques to obtain information
- Sorting and summarising information

On page 4, Key Competencies in this Unit include:

Collecting, Organising and Analysing Information

Communicating Ideas and Information

Using Mathematical Ideas and Techniques

Using Technology

Tasks involving these skills, knowledge and competencies would address Level 3 aspects of skills and communication on the National Reporting System scale (Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs, 1999). However, there is no detailed development of indicators of competence in the unit.

The unit therefore could be said to describe, in broad terms, the literacy and numeracy competencies that people need to perform these tasks to the required industry standards. Examples are given, but they are not detailed or industry-specific.

Reading, writing, speaking, listening, and numeracy skills are, however, also necessary to fulfil Performance Criteria which may not be immediately associated by trainers and trainees with literacy. Implied in these criteria is the assumption of a repertoire of literate practices (Hull et al., 1996; Gee, 1990, 1992, 1999), which would enable trainees to:

- obtain information ... [from] different sectors of the hospitality industry
- [do] informal ... research ... to update general knowledge of the hospitality industry

Details of examination of literacy and numeracy competencies in other units of the training package are to be found in Appendix A. The examination reveals:

- "Communication" features prominently in a number of training package units, and is sometimes a key competency.
  "Communication skills" are often specifically referred to at the Element, Performance Criteria and Evidence Guide level, and are always listed in Key Competencies.
- Specific literacy and numeracy competencies are implicit throughout the units, but are seldom referred to explicitly.
- Verbal skills are described in a few units, with a number of examples.
- Some of the units make implicit reference to the broader discourse of catering.
- In one of the units no literacy and numeracy skills are referred to, even implicitly.

Incorporation of literacy and numeracy in industry standards in training packages would appear to call for far more explicit reference to literacy and numeracy skills than is presently evidenced in the units of the Hospitality Training Package studied.

Literacy emerges from the social practices in which individuals engage, deriving from participation in a range of cultural groups, each

with its own set of literacy practices (Anstey and Bull, 1999). Different literacy practices arise from the range of contexts in which individuals participate, with each context requiring different ways of behaving and interacting in both oral and written modes. The concept of discourses has evolved to describe these behaviours and literacies associated with different contexts (Gee, 1990, 1992, 1999), and each individual may move daily through a number of discourses, "each of which has its commonly accepted ways of behaving, talking, reading, writing, dressing, etc." (Gee, 1992, p. 109).

The range of literacy practices in a given community is affected by location, geography, population, economy, and history. Regional and rural people may come to training with access to far fewer literacy practices than urban people (Anstey and Bull, 1999). Access to the literacies and discourses of the performance criteria of the training package may be problematic. But rural trainees in Laketown are being trained in ways that reflect urban ones, with the exception that their training may be lacking in certain services and facilities because of their remoteness.

Trainers spoke about literacy and numeracy competencies in the training package as a whole. TasTrain's Hospitality Team Leader did not think literacy and numeracy had a sufficient presence in the training package:

> *I don't think they're really there. Those skills come prior to the package. Having the package running with no prerequisites, we're seeing the results of that now, with some of the literacy problems coming through. The package doesn't address them at all, so far as I can see, until a higher level, maybe Certificate IV. We're finding that if there are areas where literacy needs to be addressed, as in telephone communication for example, they come in about Certificate III. A lot of our courses are Certificate II, and there's nothing there. Industry has driven this package with the expectation that people already have those communication skills.*

TasTrain's Manager of Cookery said:

> *There are not really any specifications regarding literacy and numeracy in the package. Level 2 is mostly practical, with only one theory unit, and you don't see that they have any literacy and numeracy problems ... Literacy problems come up with Certificate III. Eighty per cent of the training would be practical and twenty per cent theory. With the literacy and numeracy, because there is no prerequisite, we've actually put on a prerequisite ourselves, the*

college has, that a good understanding of year 10 maths and English is advisable.

Literacy and numeracy are associated in some trainers' minds with theory, rather than as factors that affect trainees' experience of the whole package, including practical work.

4.3 Discursive factors affecting clarity, readability, and with the potential to affect delivery

Detailed discourse analyses of units of the training package are to be found in Appendix B.

Training package format is uniform and uncluttered, with information in sections and columns, with headings, clear fonts, and strategic use of bold print. Where full sentences occur in the text of the units, they are mainly simple sentences, or compound sentences joined by "and". Extensive use of lists is made. These factors enhance clarity and readability.

Under Performance Criteria, sentences are mostly in the passive voice ("Sources of information on the hospitality industry are correctly identified and accessed", "Informal and/or formal research is used to update general knowledge", and "Updated knowledge is shared with customers and colleagues", Unit THHHCO01A, Hospitality Common Core, p. 1). This attempts to focus reader attention on performance, the act, rather than on the doer of the action, and to reinforce the emphasis on competencies. Further discourse analysis, however, reveals the construction of a certain situated identity in the units: the trained worker as a finished product, an identity having access to multi-literacies.

Training package language is a professional discourse. The main themes of the training package initiative recur through each unit in a uniform and therefore clear manner: Element, Performance Criteria, Range of Variables, Evidence Guide, Underpinning Skills and Knowledge, and Key Competencies. The terms are new, but since they evolved out of pre-existing training discourse, access to them and other elements of the discourse has been available to a greater or lesser extent to members of the VET sector as they increased their involvement with training packages. Training provider personnel we interviewed were adept at the "jargon" and said they found the training package units clear and readable.

Reservations were expressed on one aspect of training package language. TasTrain's Hospitality Team Leader said:

> *The competencies are very broad, and it's how you interpret them. The training package is undergoing a review this year, and it may be tightened up a little bit. I can understand why it is so broad, [for] flexibility, but I think the next round there will be some tightening up of the elements, because they're so broad, you could interpret anything.*

The Manager of Cookery agreed:

> *The general language of the training package is extremely broad, and could be more specific, but you then find it won't be as broad in its delivery. This is probably an area we're having problems with. If it was more specific it would be a lot easier to deliver.*

The dominant discourse in the training package is one of competency and successful demonstration of competency. The cultural model of success is interwoven deeply in the values of western society (Gee, 1999). People judge themselves against the model. Although the actual training package texts are read, not by trainees, but by trainers, the discursive effects of such a closely involved cultural model must filter through to trainees as the units are developed and delivered to them. Trainees' response will be affected by individual self-image and self-confidence, prior experience of success or the lack of it in learning situations, and socio-cultural factors.

4.4 Literacies of the workplace and of the training

Literacy functions are a continuum which expands to include aspects in various areas and levels of training. In order to carry out a work-related activity, people need an ability to dip appropriately and as needed into a diverse repertoire of situated ways of using speaking and listening, writing and reading (Gee, 1999). This is part of the ongoing process of the development of a 'literate identity' (Hull et al., 1996). ITAB officers, and the Access and Equity Unit coordinator of one of the RTOs involved in discussion and interview about this project, expressed general views supporting the notion of a literate identity. But the practicalities of limited time effectively restricted their involvement with literacy to attention to basic skills, and to concentration on development of strategies to manage literacy deficits at that level.

Derwent Training offered a variety of assessment methods to trainees doing Community Services (Patient Services) Certificate III. Trainees could choose to use tapes for assignments, to have verbal and interview style assessment, to have group sessions to cover the content of the work book, and to have their work book and other information put on audio tape. They took advantage of all options except for the last one, electing to work in pairs to read the work book rather than have the information put on audio tape.

All these trainees expressed difficulty with literacy and numeracy aspects of the training. They were women aged 40-50 and they often referred, to the trainer and to the researcher, to the number of years since they left school. All were Australian born and from English speaking backgrounds. Two of the older trainees had considerable literacy difficulties. They had performed their work duties satisfactorily for years

The Nurse Manager said:

> *We have the most amazing staff with the most amazing different personalities and every one of them can communicate and relate beautifully in their different ways, you put them all together and it's just a great team.*

Oral skills are a critical part of carrying out many tasks at the Multi-Purpose Health Centre.

It was only when training began that reading and writing difficulties became evident.

The Nurse Manager said:

> *You've really got to be quite a detective to find out who can or can't read and write ... Some of them disguise it pretty well. And their work mates cover up for them and help them ... It doesn't stop their caring, it doesn't stop the way that they relate with their patients and residents.*

There was no literacy teacher associated with the training. The Derwent Training trade skills trainer found this "a learning experience for all" and was "very much playing it by ear and trying to meet the needs as they present". The trainees appreciated her tact and her efforts, but communication was a problem from the beginning. When their Recognised Current Competency was being assessed, the trainees believed they were being "tested". One said: "I passed, but I didn't feel good about it." Later, when their work books arrived, together with a list of

assignment questions, they had sat down together and written "answers" to the questions, not realising that this was to be done progressively as training proceeded. They had found this task very difficult, and felt silly and resentful when it was explained how they had misunderstood. The woman with the biggest literacy and numeracy problem was intensely embarrassed about having her predicament recognised. She participated in the research because her friends did, but she avoided eye contact and kept volunteering her friends to offer comments. By the end of the research the trainee group as a whole expressed themselves as "fed up" with their training experience.

Hospitality (Catering Operations) trainees also referred more than once to the large number of years since they had left school. They also were women in their 40s and 50s, Australian born and of English speaking backgrounds. They were of a fairly basic stage of writing and numeracy ability, a slightly more advanced stage of reading, and a higher-skilled level of oral communication. Unlike Derwent Training with the Patient Services trainees, the Catering Operations RTO did not see the need to make any special arrangements for the catering trainees. The cookery teacher said: "Literacy is an underpinning skill. We assume that trainees are up to par." Communication was a problem, however. Trainees said that the cookery teacher "doesn't do anything to help people cope with the course" and that he "has an attitude". Some of his instructions conflicted with their usual practice; for example, he said that gloves are unhygienic, and they always use gloves.

In this site, training itself has become a workplace communication issue needing to be resolved.

4.5 Assessment

The Hospitality Training Package's *National User Guide to the Hospitality Industry: Competency Standards, Qualifications Framework, Assessment Guidelines (THH97)* includes a diagram (p. 22) showing how Competency Standards, Assessment Guidelines, Qualifications Framework and Learning Strategies and Resources merge in the training package. But examination of the package indicates that Learning Strategies and Resources are not laid out in the package, but are left to the RTO. The training package describes assessment rather than what is required in training.

The Australian National Training Authority's policy on assessment is clear:

> *Designing fair, valid, and reliable assessment is important if all parties are to be equally served by the assessment process. Assessment processes should allow for workers to demonstrate their skills and knowledge on-the-job ... paper based methods of assessment that assume there is only one way of doing things can unfairly disadvantage some workers.* *(ANTA 1999)*

The Hospitality Training Package's *National User Guide to the Hospitality Industry: Competency Standards, Qualifications Framework, Assessment Guidelines (THH97)* is also clear in its Guidelines for Designing Assessment Materials (p. 75).

> *Assessment conditions should be or simulate the contemporary, authentic workplace situation ... Assessment methods are equitable to all groups of participants.*

Six pages of examples of appropriate assessment and evidence gathering methods and formats are included in the *National User Guide to the Hospitality Industry: Competency Standards, Qualifications Framework, Assessment Guidelines (THH97)*, together with guidelines for conducting assessments.

However, after completion of five Catering Operations units, trainees at Laketown sat for a one-hour test, which included some True/False choices, but otherwise required written answers. The tests were delivered to management at the Multi-Purpose Health Centre, who arranged for trainees to sit for it individually in the meeting room. One of the trainees said she "went blank", and felt she did badly. All expressed anxiety that they "hadn't passed". They had not yet received feedback about the test three weeks later. They thought a spoken-word test would have been a better indicator of their performance. One said she has trouble expressing herself in writing, and in the test situation had trouble with the way the questions were phrased.

Their teacher said: "A lot of what we do in assessment is in the workplace". Communication is an issue here, because on the basis of what trainees said to our researcher, they do not appear to realise fully that some of their interaction with the teacher in the workplace is in fact assessment. What they do recognise as assessment are the traditional-type testing materials referred to above. The teacher said, because of geographical distance:

> *[W]e have to leave [assessment] packages for people and pick them up at a later time, so some of that assessment is back to the old written style.*

The test has not been made available for this research.

4.6 Attitudes to training

The main complaint from catering and domestic trainees was that they got no time off from work for training purposes, and that they had to train on their day off and do "homework" at home when they wanted to relax after a day's work. They were not paid for out of hours training, an issue which their union is pursuing. They felt there were no incentives for them to train, as "none of them would ever be working anywhere else". They would work on at the Centre until they retired, and they did not see that the training they were doing would make their work any better. One of the catering operations trainees said: "I'm that nervous and stressed" and that this was due to the training.

Regional and rural people have less access to student advisory services than city people.

TasTrain's Cookery Manager said:

> *We have Student Services on campus, so if students do have problems there is the opportunity for them to seek counsel. I don't know how we're going to address those issues for people living in rural areas.*

Literacy and numeracy features of job tasks performed by catering and domestic workers at the Centre have a predictable structure and familiar vocabulary. Most tasks involve aspects of communication corresponding to National Reporting System Level 2. These tasks are shift reports, Meals on Wheels lists, notes on hostel and nursing home residents who will be absent for a meal for whatever reason, and menu lists. All have a standard reporting format requiring either ticks in boxes, single sentence responses, writing of names, foods and dishes, some annotation of time and numerical data and a brief summary of the status of the job.

The trainees can do these tasks, and have been performing them for years, sometimes with help from a friend. Implicit in all trainees' comments is a belief that the language, literacy and numeracy skills required for participation in training exceed those required on the job.

The Community, Property and Health Services ITAB executive officer said:

> *For the average person who's going about their work, it's a complex language, talking of competency standards ... Even the word 'assessment' can be threatening. By and large, in Community Services, we're talking about older women who have no formal qualifications, and for whom school was ... maybe not something they particularly enjoyed. So to be talked to about having their skills recognised in a formal way, without putting people off and thinking they're going to have to write essays or tests, [but] instead having someone observe them as they go about their normal work, I think it's a matter of marketing and promotion, to reassure people. Each one of us has a part to play in this, but I feel really in some ways it does go back to ANTA in terms of how they market the complexities of it.*

ANTA is looking at social marketing of lifelong learning, to create a culture where lifelong learning is valued and the concept becomes the norm (Dickie & Weeks, 1999). The concept of lifelong learning subsumes vocational education and training, and therefore training packages. This sort of promotion of what is for many people a new cultural model, needs to be structured with equity groups in mind, because values are not the same in rural and regional Australia as in the cities where these marketing initiatives come from. There is not a tradition of formal vocational education and training in rural Australia (Kilpatrick & Bell, 1998). Rural people's learning patterns form amid traditions of nonformal and experiential learning and they tend to have low confidence as formal learners or trainees (Kilpatrick & Rosenblatt, 1998). Their literacy practices may reflect this (Anstey & Bull, 1999).

Issues of literacies in training in regional and rural centres may form part of the broader context of the great division in Australian society, the urban-regional/rural divide, an interface where literacies, like other social practices, define who belongs and who does not, who gets opportunities and who does not. Educational choices available to rural people are inequitable and very different compared to those for people from metropolitan areas (Falk & Golding, 1999). Training opportunities, choices, methods of delivery, success rates, all occur in a context of

problematic mutual perceptions and mind-sets of urban and rural people. Values, situated identities, cultural models, the discursive aspects of training and of promotion of training and lifelong learning, all impact on the question of access, marking and sometimes perpetuating division.

4.7 Summary

Firm conclusions about outcomes are difficult, owing to the relatively early stage of implementation of the training package. Trainers have been faced with adaptations needing to be made quickly and some anomalies in delivery have occurred. Strategies for dealing with language, literacy and numeracy do not appear to have been an initial priority.

The relevant units of the Hospitality Training Package show an uneven presence of literacy and numeracy competencies. "Communication skills" are often referred to at the Element, Performance Criteria and Evidence Guide level, and are always listed in Key Competencies, but what exactly these skills involve is not detailed. Trainers interviewed did not think literacy and numeracy had a sufficient presence in the training package. Literacy and numeracy are associated in some trainers' minds with theory, rather than as factors that affect trainees' experience of the whole package, including practical work.

Training package language is a professional discourse, but the units are clear and readable.

The dominant discourse in the training package is one of competency and successful demonstration of competency. A dominant discursive feature is a situated identity which depicts a finished product: the trained worker as an identity having access to multi-literacies in order to function in the workplace.

At the site investigated, training itself has become a workplace communication issue needing to be resolved.

Chapter Five

5.1 Conclusions

Literacy functions are a continuum, an expanding repertoire of situated ways of using speaking and listening, writing and reading, part of the ongoing process of the development of a 'literate identity'. Literacies give access to discourses. They decide who belongs in a group or society, and who does not; who is successful at training, and who is anxious and stressed about the training experience. But literacy and numeracy continue to be regarded by training providers merely as basic skills, a notion which hinders more effective facilitation of training delivery at diverse levels and in diverse places.

Literacy and numeracy competencies are implicitly woven through the fabric of the Hospitality Training Package. Compilers of the package recognise literacy and numeracy competencies as underpinning skills in any on-the-job performance. Literacy and numeracy skills are recognised as necessary to perform specific tasks. In most units, however, description of literate and numerate activities is not specified in the detail that reflects on-the-job performance, and some units are cursory in their inclusion of literacy and numeracy competencies. Consistent degrees of precision and detail should apply through all the Hospitality Training Package units' descriptions of literacy and numeracy competencies.

Anomalies of delivery occur when trainers have insufficient time, given the day-to-day demands of their work, to prepare for the major shift from curriculum based to training package delivery. Trainees' anxiety and drop-out rates increase because of literacy practices gaps which the training experience may emphasise negatively. Training providers need to be constantly aware that the level of communication skills required in training and in assessment should not exceed those required on the job. This is a complex matter, as training language includes discursive elements which may be outside the literacy practices of trainees. In relation to this area, trainers need to be able to review their provision of assessment services to make assessment more trainee-friendly, in line with the stated aims of ANTA.

5.2 Summary

In summary, the research findings are:

- With regard to implementation of the Hospitality Training Package, trainers have had insufficient time to address the major shift from the curriculum based system to the training package.
- No major change has occurred in the way that Certificate III (Catering Operations) is being delivered to regional and rural trainees, nor in assessment modes.
- Strategies for dealing with language, literacy and numeracy have not been an initial priority with trainers.
- Units of the Hospitality Training Package show an uneven presence of literacy and numeracy competencies. Incorporation of literacy and numeracy in industry standards in training packages would appear to call for far more explicit reference to literacy and numeracy skills than is presently evidenced in the units of the Hospitality Training Package studied.
- The dominant discourse of the training package derives from the context of Vocational Education and Training. The document is clear and readable, but trainers interviewed said the language of the competencies is too broad, making delivery more difficult.
- The discourse of the training package is predominantly about measurement and assessment, rather than about learning and training.
- The dominant discursive feature is a situated identity which depicts a finished product: the trained worker as an identity having access to multi-literacies. The package links trainee and competencies in a framework of individual responsibility. The trainer is a predominantly absent identity in the package.
- Regional and rural trainees miss out on services such as student counselling, and in the site investigated literacy teachers are not being used to assist trainees having difficulty.
- Older rural trainees may have different literacy practices, values, and perceptions of training from their metropolitan counterparts. These factors may impact on their training. Getting regional and rural people to value training will require a significant cultural change. ANTA's social marketing initiatives will be addressing this, with the diversity of the population in mind (Dickie & Weeks, 1999). A particular emphasis structured for regional and rural targets would appear to be required.

References

Anstey, M., & Bull, G. 1999. 'Communicating literacies: How community affects literacy practice'. Centre for Literacy and Children's Literature Education and Research, University of Southern Queensland. http://www.btr.qld.edu.au/news.htm

Askov, E., & Aderman, B. 1991, 'Understanding the history and definitions of workplace literacy', in M. Taylor, G. Lewe & J. Draper eds., *Basic skills for the workplace*. Culture Concepts Inc., Toronto.

Australian Bureau of Statistics, 1995. *Social Trends*. Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra.

Australian Bureau of Statistics, 1996. *Australian Demographic Statistics*. Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra.

Australian Bureau of Statistics, 1999. *Older People: Australia*. Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra.

Australian National Training Authority, 1998. 'Workplace communication: incorporation of language, literacy and numeracy into training packages'. Commonwealth of Australia, Canberra.

Australian National Training Authority, 1999. 'Workplace Communication: April 1999 Update'. Commonwealth of Australia, Canberra.

Australian Oxford Dictionary, 1976, ed. G. Johnston. Oxford University Press, Melbourne.

Department of Employment, Education and Training, 1993, *The workplace English language and literacy program: 1993 guidelines*. Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra.

Department of Employment, Education and Training, 1997. *Workplace Communication in National Training Packages: A Practical Guide*. Commonwealth of Australia, Canberra.

Department of Education, Training and Youth Affairs, 1999. 'The National Reporting System', on http://nrs.detya.gov.au

Dickie, M., & Weeks, M.S. 1999. *Introductory Speech: ANTA Training Update Seminar, Nov. 1999*, http://www.anta.gov.au/

Fairclough, N. 1989. *Language and power*. Longman, London.

Falk, I. 1994. 'The making of policy: media discourse conversations'. *Discourse*, vol.15, no.2, pp.1-12.

Falk, I., & Golding, B. 1999. 'A view from the Centre: equity and VET in regional Australia'. *Training Agenda*, vol.7, no.1, pp.6-7.

Foucault, M. 1969. *The Archaeology of Knowledge*. Tavistock, London.

Freebody, P., & Welch, A.R. (Eds.) 1993. *Knowledge, culture and power: International perspectives on literacy as policy and practice*. The Falmer Press, London

Galvin, B. 1998. 'Industry training packages – tourism and hospitality'. *Australian Journal of Hospitality Management*, vol.5, no.1, pp.61-64.

Gee, J.P. 1990. *Social Linguistics and Literacies: Ideology in Discourses*. The Falmer Press, London.

Gee, J.P. 1992. *The Social Mind: Language, Ideology, and Social Practice*. Bergin and Garvey, New York.

Gee, J.P. 1999. *An Introduction to Discourse Analysis*. Routledge, London.

Gibb, J., Keenan, M., & Solomon, N. 1996. *Literacy at work: incorporating English language and literacy competencies into industry/enterprise standards*. Australian Government Publishing Service, Canberra.

Habermas, J. 1971. *Knowledge and Human Interests*. Beacon Press, Boston.

Hawke, G., Moy, J. & Mawer, G., 1997. *Training packages and the quality of vocational education and training*. Research Centre for Vocational Education and Training, University of Technology, Sydney.

Hull, G., Jury, M., Ziv, O., Katz, M. 1996. *Changing work, changing literacy? A study of skill requirements and redevelopment in a traditional and restructured workplace. Final Report*. University of California, Berkeley.

Kilpatrick, S., & Bell, R. 1998. 'What's different away from the rat race?: Issues for VET in non-metropolitan Australia'. Paper presented at the AVETRA Conference 1998. CRLRA Discussion Paper Series, D5/1998, Launceston.

Kilpatrick, S., Williamson, J., Thrush, M. 1999. 'Access and equity within education and training for people in rural and remote Australia'. CRLRA Reprint Series, R3/1999, Launceston.

Lincoln, Y.S., & Guba, E.G. 1985. *Naturalistic Inquiry*. Sage, Beverly Hills.

Mikulecky, L.1988, *Literacy for the workplace*. Indiana University, Bloomington.

Newcombe, J. 1994. Literacy at work: the workplace basic education project model of delivery. OECD, Deakin University, Geelong, Vic.

O'Connor, P. 1993, 'Workplace literacy in Australia: Competing agenda', .. P Freebody & A Welch (Eds.), *Knowledge, culture and power: International perspectives on literacy as policy and practice*, The Falmer Press, London, pp.187-208.

Patton, M.Q. 1990. *Qualitative Evaluation and Research Methods*, 2nd ed. Sage, Newbury Park

Smith, A. 1999. *Creating a future: training, learning and the older person*. National Centre for Vocational Education Research Ltd., Kensington Park, SA.

Tasmanian Government, 1999. http://www.dch.tas.gov.au/moreinfo/more_about_tas/demography/12.html

Appendix A

Examination of literacy and numeracy competencies in units of the training package

Units of the training package were examined for comprehensiveness and accuracy of literacy and numeracy competencies. These are units which form the qualification Certificate III (Catering Operations).

From Core Units:

THHCOR01A *Work with Colleagues and Customers*

"Communication" features prominently in the Unit Descriptor, at the Element and Performance levels, and in the Evidence Guide. "Language", "body language", "listening and questioning" are also listed in the Performance Criteria, and "listening, questioning, non-verbal communication" in Underpinning Skills and Knowledge. No mention of reading and writing occurs, but reading skills may be implicit in references to "specific needs [groups] covered by the Disability Discrimination Act (1992)" and "special cultural needs" (page 3).

THHCOR02A *Work in a Socially Diverse Environment*

Communication skills are identified as key competencies. "Verbal and non-verbal communication" and communication across "language barriers" are mentioned at the Element and the Performance Criteria levels, through the Range of Variables, and in the Evidence Guide. Reading is implied in "assistance from ... reference books" (page 5). It may be involved in "recognition of the different cultural groups in Australian society", "basic knowledge of the culture of Australia's indigenous and non-indigenous peoples" and "principles of Equal Employment Opportunity etc." (page 8), but it is not referred to explicitly.

THHCOR03A *Follow Health, Safety and Security Procedures*

Literacy and numeracy skills are not specifically listed at the Element level, nor at the Performance Criteria level, although they are implied in a number of performance criteria. For example, "followed in accordance with enterprise policy and relevant legislation and insurance requirements" and "emergency procedures are correctly followed" would

involve some reading. In the Range of Variables, reference to "emergency, fire and accident" and "hazard identification" implies reading skill, as does "safe handling". Underpinning Skills and Knowledge imply ability to read, but do not state it.

THHHCO01A Develop and Update Hospitality Industry Knowledge
This unit is examined in the body of the report. (See 5.2 Examination of literacy and numeracy competencies in units of the training package.)

THHGHS01A Follow Workplace Hygiene Procedures
Literacy and numeracy skills are implicitly necessary to develop competencies at the Element and Performance Criteria levels, but are not referred to explicitly. The only explicit reference to communication and numeracy skills in the unit is in the Key Competencies table on page 3.

THHBCC11A Implement Food Safety Procedures
Literacy and numeracy competencies are crucial, but only implied, at the Element level, in "identify food safety hazards" and "identify critical control points ... using the HACCP method" (page 44), and at the Performance Criteria level, in "all biological, physical and chemical hazards are identified", "control points ... including purchasing, delivery and storage, ... cooling and storage, ... rethermalisation", "the process flow chart is followed" and "internal and external auditing and validation are undertaken" (page 44). The Evidence Guide requires "knowledge and understanding" of a number of areas, including "microbiological hazards ... [and] HACCP recording requirements according to regulatory standards" (page 45).

"The assessment should include comprehensive theory tests or questioning" (page 45). This is a unit which requires a range of literacy and numeracy competencies, but which does not state any of them.

THHBCAT02A Package Prepared Foodstuffs
Literacy and numeracy competencies are implied at the Element and Performance Criteria levels. Workers have to be able to read to be able to "ensure food is suitable for packaging, storage and transportation ... in terms of ... shelf-life [and] microbiological condition" and to "label foods according to Australian and New Zealand Food Authority regulations" (page 5), but none of the literacy and numeracy skills are specified.

THHBCAT03A Transport and Store Food in a Safe and Hygienic Manner

The examples given at the Performance Criteria level imply that the worker must be able to read "Statutory Requirements" and temperature gauges and must be able to write in order to "maintain appropriate records of food transportation" (page 7).

THHBCAT06A Apply Catering Control Procedures

Examples given at the Performance Criteria level imply reading and writing and numeracy skills in "ordering to specifications, stock rotation, ... appropriate storage, standard recipe cards", and "recipes are followed accurately to avoid mistakes" and "stock is rotated and accurately documented".

THHBCC13A Plan and Control Menu Based Catering

This unit "deals with the processes involved in planning, preparing and controlling menus" (page 49). Performance Criteria include "menus are costed to comply with given costing restraints", "production schedules are planned", "labour costs are controlled with consideration given to rosters, scheduling, award conditions and rates", and "stock control measures are applied by following correct receiving and storing procedures" (page 49). All these criteria imply a range of literacy and numeracy competencies, but do not state them explicitly. "Production planning sheets, sales analysis forms, daily kitchen reports, wastage sheets" require writing skills, but they are not elaborated here. The Range of Variables refers implicitly to the broader discourse of catering: "menus are prepared using terminology appropriate to the market and style of menu [and] item descriptions which will promote the dishes".

THHADCAT01A Prepare Daily Meal Plans to Promote Good Health

Examples at the Element and Performance Criteria levels imply reading and writing and numeracy skills: "prepare daily meal plans and menus", "considering Dietary Guidelines for Australians ... food of differing energy and nutrient density".

THHGGA01A Communicate on the Telephone

Verbal skills are described with a number of examples at the Performance Criteria level (page 1) and are listed as Underpinning Skills (page 3). "Details are repeated to caller to confirm understanding" and "messages

are accurately relayed" (page 1) imply writing skills, which are specifically listed in Underpinning Skills: "basic written skills for taking messages" (page 3). Numeracy skills are implied in "Correct telephone numbers are obtained" (page 1), and the Key Competencies list "Using Mathematical Ideas and Techniques" at a performance level of 1.

THHGCS02A Promote Products and Services to Customers
Examples at the Performance Criteria level imply reading skills: "formal research ... to update knowledge" (page 4). The Range of Variables explicitly refers to "reading enterprise information" and "research of product and service information brochures" (page 5).

THHGCS03A Deal with Conflict Situations
Communication skills are implied at the Performance Criteria level, in "all points of view are encouraged, accepted and treated with respect" and in "complaints are handled sensitively etc." (page 7). "Effective communication skills" are referred to but not specified (page 7). "Any necessary documentation is completed accurately and legibly" (page 7) involves writing skills.

THHGTR01A Coach Others in Job Skills
Communication skills, "specifically the use of questioning techniques and clarity in oral communication", and "clarity in communication" are specifically referred to at the Evidence Guide level, and listed in Key Competencies at a level of 3 (page 3).

From the Elective Units:
THHBCC02A Prepare Appetisers and Salads
No literacy and numeracy skills are listed in the unit. Reading is implied in "appetisers are produced using the correct ingredients" (page 13), in further description of appetisers (page 14), and in "historical development of menus, modern trends in menus". Reading, writing and numeracy competencies are implicit in "inventory and stock control systems", "purchasing, receiving, storing, holding and issuing procedures" and "costing, yield testing, portion control" (page 15). The Identification of Key Competencies table lists Collecting, Analysing and Organising Information and Planning and Organising Activities as level 2, with Using Mathematical Ideas and Techniques as level 1.

The following units are grouped together here. Literacy and numeracy competencies are implied only, similar to the model of Unit THHBCC02A (see above).

THHBCC02aA *Prepare Sandwiches*

THHBCC03A *Prepare Stocks and Sauces*

THHBCC03aA *Prepare Soups*

THHBCC04A *Prepare Vegetables, Eggs and Farinaceous Dishes.* Reference is made at the Performance level to "according to standard recipes" (page 23).

THHBCC08A *Prepare Hot and Cold Desserts.* Performance Criteria imply reading and numeracy skills in "ingredients are selected, measured and weighed according to recipe requirements", "sauces are stored to retain desired characteristics", and "desserts are stored at the appropriate temperature and under the correct conditions".

In summary, examination of literacy and numeracy competencies in units of the training package reveals:

- "Communication" features prominently in a number of training package units, and is sometimes a key competency. "Communication skills" are often specifically referred to at the Element, Performance Criteria and Evidence Guide level, and are always listed in Key Competencies.
- Specific literacy and numeracy competencies are implicit throughout the units, but are seldom referred to explicitly.
- Verbal skills are described in a few units, with a number of examples.
- Some of the units make implicit reference to the broader discourse of catering.
- In one of the units no literacy and numeracy skills are referred to, even implicitly.

Appendix B

Discourse analysis of five core units

Gee's work on examination of subsystems of the discourse system of language (1990) offers insight into how elements of language work together to constitute meaning. Strategies for analysing the interaction of operant subsystems in a text focus on the use of 'tools of inquiry' (Gee, 1999). Among the primary tools of inquiry are situated identities, social languages, discourses, and situated meanings (Gee, 1999), and these factors are operant in the training package.

Subjecting training package units to critical discourse analysis involves an awareness of the position of the analyst. Discourse analysis is a distinctive social activity, and the analyst must be aware of his or her position in the process (Gee, 1999). In the general context of this vocational and educational training research, analyst and texts share certain situated meanings. In the specific context of this research into the Hospitality Training Package, the analyst has more of an external perspective.

Different approaches to discourse analysis are appropriate to different issues and questions. Our analysis is based on assessment of the situated meanings and situated identities of words and phrases in the text, "given what is known about the overall context in which the data occurred" (Gee, 1999, p. 97), and of the cultural models promoted in it. These aspects, working together, construct a discourse.

The framework of all the units of the Hospitality Training Package is constructed in a particular variant of a social language, a variant of professional discourse. The main headings, *Unit Descriptor, Element, Performance Criteria, Variables, Evidence Guide*, are key nouns from this discourse. The nouns derive from quantitative discourse. They emphasise the fact that the training package describes assessment rather than what is required in training. Other recurring examples of language that reinforces the assessment focus are: *demonstrate competence, evidence of skills and knowledge*, which appear on the Evidence Guide page, and assessment

itself, which appears numerous times in various parts of speech forms, especially on the final page of each unit.

Skills and *knowledge*, other recurring terms in the package, derive from the discourse of Vocational Education and Training. The term *underpinning* recurs in various forms. To *underpin* is "to support or strengthen (esp. building) from beneath" (The Australian Oxford Dictionary). No training package specific definition of *underpin* is given in the package. Lists of Underpinning Skills and Knowledge occur in all units, and some of the lists are quite lengthy. These underpinning skills are clearly prerequisites for training, if they are to "support/strengthen" it.

The Hospitality Training Package seeks to encompass the training needs of widely disparate sectors of the industry. Discourse analysis of its units underlines the generic character of much of its language. This is particularly evident in the area of situated meanings, the images or patterns that readers assemble during the act of communicating in a given context, based on their construal of that context and on their own past experiences (Gee, 1999). Situated meanings are associated with cultural models, the groups of connecting images shared by people belonging to specific social or cultural groups, and which are distributed across the different sorts of expertise and viewpoints found in any group (Gee, 1999).

The situated meanings operant in these units of the Hospitality Training Package derive from a Vocational and Educational Training discourse shared by a group which includes training organisations and industry training advisory bodies. Much of this discourse in the training package is quantitative. But terms are broad, presumably in the interests of flexibility of application of the package to disparate industry contexts. In *Work with Colleagues and Customers*, terms such as "appropriate", "effective", and "acceptable" are used in a cover-all manner. In *Develop and Update Hospitality Industry Knowledge* "effective work performance" is not defined, but it is "assisted" by the "accessing" of information relating to ten listed but largely undefined areas, including "quality assurance", and "work ethic required to work in the industry". "Updated knowledge is shared with customers and colleagues as appropriate", but no examples are given of what is "appropriate". The situated meanings in the Evidence Guide are also broad ("general knowledge", "overview").

A situated identity is constructed through units of the training package. It is that of the trainee who, it is envisaged, will be able to demonstrate the relevant competencies.

In Unit *THHCOR01A: Work with Colleagues and Customers*, Elements 1 and 2 construct a situated identity of a worker who is communicative and helpful: "communicate in the workplace" and "provide assistance". The Performance Criteria develop the identity: "open, professional and friendly manner", a person who uses "appropriate language and tone", considers "effect of personal body language", shows "sensitivity to cultural and social differences", is an "active listener and questioner", "friendly and courteous", "polite". The person "correctly identifies" "customer needs and expectations", "potential conflicts", and "opportunities to enhance the quality of service". This is a positive-minded identity who efficiently deals with interpersonal situations or efficiently refers them on, "in accordance with individual level of responsibility".

Element 3 includes the element of "personal presentation standards" in the situated identity construct. Element 4 applies aspects of the situated identity constructed in Elements 1 and 2 to the ability to "work in a team", adding the characteristic of flexibility: "cultural differences ... are accommodated", "changes ... are re-negotiated".

Speaking and listening skills are crucial to the way this situated identity functions.

The unit *THHCOR02A: Work in a Socially Diverse Environment* continues the construction of the situated identity which emerged from *Work with Colleagues and Customers*. Language skills are once again highly important: "verbal and non verbal communication", "efforts are made to communicate through use of gestures or simple words in the other person's language". The Range of Variables includes "language spoken, forms of address, levels of formality/informality, non-verbal behaviour" and "attempts to overcome language barriers" such as "meet and greet/farewell customers, give simple directions, give simple instructions, answer simple enquiries, ... describe ...".

The Evidence Guide asks for "a demonstrated knowledge of what it means to be 'culturally aware' and a demonstrated ability to communicate effectively with customers and colleagues from a broad range of backgrounds as required for the relevant job role". Cultural awareness and the ability to communicate cross-culturally are valuable personal and community attributes and it is appropriate that all hospitality trainees develop these attributes, but some trainees may be disadvantaged here, because of limited exposure to other cultures. The social practices involved in development of these attributes involve literacy practices. In

regional and rural localities, the range of literacy practices available may be negatively affected by their location, population, range of economic and other roles people play, and by their history (Anstey and Bull, 1999).

The situated identity constructed in the unit *THHCOR03A: Follow Health, Safety and Security Procedures* is that of a person who can "deal with", whose actions are "prompt" (the word appears five times in the Performance Criteria), and "correct".

The unit *THHGHS01A: Follow Workplace Hygiene Procedures* is comparatively brief, because "for sector specific delivery, training should be tailored to meet the needs of that sector". Here the situated identity constructed in Element 1 and its Performance Criteria is that of a person who "follows strictly" when it comes to hygiene procedures, although the Evidence Guide tells assessors to "look for understanding ... knowledge ... and ability".

In *THHHCO01A: Develop and Update Hospitality Industry Knowledge*, both Elements imply a specific situated identity in respect of the trainee. The trainee can "seek information on the hospitality industry" and "update hospitality industry knowledge". He or she is a person attuned to information and knowledge needs and access. The Performance Criteria add detail to the description of this situated identity: he or she is a person who can "correctly identify and access", "obtain information", "access and update", "correctly apply" and "incorporate updated knowledge". The situated identity emerging from Elements, Performance Criteria, and the Evidence Guide is one of capability, efficiency and effectiveness, and is very much a literate identity.

The dominant discursive feature of these units of the Hospitality Training Package is therefore a situated identity which depicts a finished product, the trained worker as a *fait accompli*. The worker is a friendly, communicative, courteous, polite, positive-minded and helpful professional who uses appropriate language and tone and shows sensitivity to cultural and social differences. He or she is an active listener and questioner, is flexible, and can deal capably, efficiently and effectively with situations. He or she is an identity who, in other words, has access to multi-literacies. Verbal performances are rated in terms of efficiency and workplace competency, which is an instrumental ideology of language - language as a tool for getting things done.

The discourse here is about competencies and evidence of competencies, or assessment. There is no *training* discourse. The trainer is invisible, unless he or she is also the assessor, in which case he or she is

present, very occasionally, in the second person: "Look for understanding ... knowledge ..." (*THHGHS01A*, page 3), and "Note that ..."(*THHHCO01A*, page 4). Most references to training and to assessment are expressed in modal auxiliary verbs like may and should, for example: "This unit may be assessed on or off-the-job. Assessment should include ..." and "it should be assessed" (*THHGHS01A*, page 3), and "Evidence should include ..." and "Assessment should take account of ..." (*THHCOR01A*, page 4). Modality relates to writer authority (Fairclough, 1989). The assessment discourse of the training package units is shaped by relational modalities in the text, involving authority relations between writers and readers, and by expressive modalities, the modality of the writers' evaluation of the construction of reality in the training package.

In summary, discourse analysis of these units of the training package reveals:

- a dominant discourse from the context of Vocational Education and Training, and
- a discourse which is predominantly quantitative, emphasising the fact that the training package describes assessment rather than what is required in training.
- Much of its language has a generic character, and terms are broad.
- The dominant discursive feature is a situated identity which depicts a finished product: the trained worker as an identity having access to multi-literacies.
- The trainer is a predominantly absent identity in the package.
- The package links trainee and competencies in a framework of individual responsibility.

Published by

Language Australia Ltd